The Western Fathers in the *Confessio Patrum*

by

Awad Wadi

Introduction

The *Confessio Patrum* (*The Faith of the Fathers*; *I'tirāf al-Ābā'*, later translated into Ethiopic as *Haymanotä Abäw*) is a unique work of its kind in Christian Arabic Literature. The text is based on Greek and Coptic sources known as *Florilegia*. In some ways it resembles al-*Durr al-ṯamīn fī Iḍāḥ al-i'tiqād fī-al-dīn* attributed to the Coptic bishop Severus Ibn al-Muqaffa' (10th century). The work contains a series of writings ascribed to the Fathers of the Church and to other Christian writers who lived after them, especially the Synodical letters of the Coptic Patriarchs to the Syrian Patriarchs in defence of the so-called Monophysite faith in Christ of the Coptic Church.

The testimonies are generally given in a chronological order, even if this is not always respected.

The Western Fathers are listed after St. Gregory of Nyssa († 395) and before St. Ephrem the Syrian († 373), whereas St. Irenaeus of Lyon († 202) appears in the second place after the *Didascalia*.

I will first discuss the previous studies, then the manuscripts and editions of the work. A detailed study of the texts attributed to the Western authors compared with the original texts will follow, focusing on the place of the Western Fathers in it. I will also deal with the same texts in the work attributed to Severus Ibn al-Muqaffa'.

SOC Collectanea 45 (2012), pp. 105-129.

Bibliography

- BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977 = E. BELLINI (a cura), *Su Cristo. Il grande dibattito nel quarto secolo*, Milano, 1977;

- CAVALLERA, "Le dossier", 1909 = F. CAVALLERA, "Le dossier patristique de Timothée Ælure", *Bulletin de Littérature Ecclésiastique* 1 (1909), pp. 342-359;

- *CE* = *The Coptic Encyclopedia*, 8 vol., ed. A.S. ATIYA, New York, 1991;

- CONYBEARE, "The Patristic", 1914 = F.C. CONYBEARE, "The Patristic *Testimonia* of Timotheus Aelurus" (Irenaeus, Athanasius, Dionysius)", *The Journal of Theological Studies* 15 (1914), pp. 432-442;

- *CP* = *Confessio Patrum*;

- *CP*, 2002, ed. = Dayr al-Muḥarraq, *I'tirāf al-Ābā'*, Cairo, 2002;

- CSCO = Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium;

- CYRILLUS, *De Recta fide*, 1760 = CYRILLUS, *De Recta fide ad reginas* (Mansi, *Sacrorum Conciliorum nova et amplissima collectio*, 4), Firenze,1760 (Graz,1960), col. 679-802, specially 689-698);

- CYRILLUS, *De Recta fide*, 1863 = CYRILLUS, *De Recta fide ad reginas* (PG, 76), Paris, 1863, col. 1201-1336;

- DI BERARDINO, *Patrologia*, 3, 1978 = DI BERARDINO, a cura, *Patrologia*, vol. 3, Casale, 1978;

- DI BERARDINO, *Patrologia*, 5, 2000 = A. DI BERARDINO, a cura, *Patrologia*, vol. 5, Genova, 2000, ristampa, 2005;

- FLEMMING, LIETZMANN, *ASc*, 1904 = J. FLEMMING, H. LIETZMANN, *Apollinaristische Schriften syrisch*, Berlin, 1904;

- G = G. GRAF, *Catalogue des manuscrits arabes chrétiens conservés au Caire* (Studi e Testi, 63), Città del Vaticano, 1934;

- GRAF, "Unechte", 1929 = G. GRAF, "Unechte Zeugnisse römischer Päpste für den Monophysitismus im arabischen „Bekenntnis der Väter"", *Römische Quartalschrift* 36 (1929), pp. 197-233;

- GRAF, "Zwei", 1937 = G. GRAF, "Zwei dogmatische Florilegien der Kopten, B. Das Bekenntnis der Väter", *Orientalia Christiana Periodica* 3 (1937), pp. 345-402;

- GRAF, *GCAL*, 2, 1947 = G. GRAF, *Geschichte der christlichen arabischen Literatur*, vol. 2 (Studi e Testi, 133), Città del Vaticano, 1947, pp. 321-323;

- GRILLMEIER, *Christ*, 1, 1975 = A. GRILLMEIER, *Christ in Christian Tradition*, vol. 1. Trans. J. Bowden, London, 1975;

- GRILLMEIER, *Gesù*, 1, 1982 = A. GRILLMEIER, *Gesù il Cristo nella fede della chiesa*, vol. 1 (Biblioteca teologica), Brescia, 1982;

- GRILLMEIER, *Gesù*, 2, 2001= A. GRILLMEIER, *Gesù il Cristo nella fede della chiesa*, vol. II/1 (Biblioteca teologica), Brescia, 2001;

- GRILLMEIER, *Le Christ*, 1990 = A. GRILLMEIER, *Le Christ dans la tradition chrétienne. Le concile de Chalcédonie (451) réception et opposition*, Paris, 1990;

- GRILLMEIER, *Le Christ*, 1996 = A. GRILLMEIER, *Le Christ dans la tradition chrétienne. L'Église d'Alexandrie, la Nubie et l'Éthiopie, après 451*, Paris, 1996;

- JORDAN, "Wer war Archaeus?", 1912 = H. JORDAN, "Wer war Archaeus?", *Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft* 13 (1912), pp. 157-160;

- JORDAN, *AI*, 1913 = H. JORDAN, *Armenische Irenaeusfragmente* (Texte und Untersuchungen, 36, 3), Leipzig, 1913, pp. 66-73, 76-79, 83, 213;

- LAGARDE, *AS*, 1885 = Paul de LAGARDE, *Analecta Syriaca*, Leipzig, 1858;

- LEBON, "Les citations", 1929 = J. LEBON, "Les citations patristiques grecques du *Sceau de la foi*", *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique* 25 (1929), pp. 5-32;

- LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904 = Hans LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris von Laodicea und seine Schule* (TU), Tübingen, 1904;

- MAI, *SR*, 1840 = A. MAI, *Spicilegium Romanum*, tomus, 3, Roma, 1840, pp. 694-740;

- MS = manuscript, manuscripts

- *MS*, 1, 1869 = P. ZINGERLE, *Monumenta syriaca ex romanis codicibus collecta* (MS Vat. Syriac 135), vol. 1, Innsbruck, 1869;

- *MS*, 2, 1878 = G. MOESINGER, *Monumenta syriaca ex romanis codicibus collecta*, vol. 2, Innsbruck, 1878;

- NAUTIN, *Le dossier*, 1953 = P. NAUTIN, *Le dossier d'Hippolyte et de Méliton dans les florilèges dogmatiques et chez les historiens modernes*, Paris, 1953;

- *NDPAC = Nuovo Dizionario Patristico e di antichità cristiane*. Diretto da Angelo DI BERARDINO, 3 vol. consecutive numbering, Casale, 2006-2008;

- *PG = Patrologia Graeca*;

- *PL = Patrologia Latina*;

- PHILOXÈNE, *Lettre* (CSCO, 231-232), 1963 = PHILOXÈNE de Mabbog, *Lettre aux moines de Senoun* (CSCO, 231-232, s. Syri, 98-99). Ed. and trans. A. de HALLEUX, Louvain, 1963;

- PITRA, *AS*, 2, 1884 = J.B. PITRA, *Analecta sacra*, vol. 2, Paris, 1884;

- PITRA, *AS*, 4, 1883 = J.B. PITRA, *Analecta sacra*, vol. 4, Paris, 1883;

- QUASTEN, *Patrologia*, 1, 1975 = J. QUASTEN, *Patrologia*, vol. 1, Casale, terza edizione, 1975;

- QUASTEN, *Patrologia*, 2, 1973 = J. QUASTEN, *Patrologia*, vol. 2, Casale, seconda edizione, 1973;

- RUCKER, *FEA*, 1933 = I. RUCKER, *Florilegium Edessenum Anonymum* (syriace ante 562) (Sitzungsberichte Bayer. Akad., 5), München, 1933;

- S = M. SIMAIKA, YASSA 'Abd al-Masiḥ, *Catalogue of the Coptic and Arabic Manuscripts in the Coptic Museum, the Patriarchate, the Principal Churches of Cairo and*

Alexandria and the Monasteries of Egypt, 2 vol., Cairo, 1939, 1942;

- s. = Scriptores;

- SC = Sources Chrétiennes;

- *Sceau de la foi*, 1914 = *Sceau de la foi de la sainte Église universelle de nos saints Pères orthodoxes et inspirés, composé aux jours du catholicos Komitas* (armenian), Etschmiadsin, 1914;

- SCHWARTZ, *Codex Vaticanus*, 1927 = E. SCHWARTZ, *Codex Vaticanus gr. 1431* (Abhandlungen der Bayerischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, Bd. XXXII, Abhandlung, 6) München, 1927;

- SEVERUS (CSCO, 119-120), 1949 = SEVERUS Antiochenus, *Orationes ad Nephalium. Eiusdem ac Sergii Grammatici epistulae mutuae* (CSCO, 119-120, s. Syri 64-65). Ed. and trans. I. LEBON, Louvain, 1949;

- SEVERUS (CSCO, 93-94), 1952 = SEVERUS Antiochenus, *Liber contra impium Grammaticum, oratione tertiae pars prior* (CSCO, 93-94, s. Syri, 45-46). Ed and trans. I. LEBON, Louvain, 1952;

- SEVERUS (CSCO, 101-102), 1959 = SEVERUS Antiochenus, *Liber contra impium Grammaticum, oratione tertiae pars posterior* (CSCO, 101-102, s. Syri, 50-51). Ed. and trans. I. LEBON, Louvain, 1959;

- SÉVÈRE (CSCO, 244-245), 1964 = SÉVÈRE d'Antioche, *La polémique antijulianiste, I, premier échange de lettres*... (CSCO, 244-245, s. Syri, 104-105). Ed. and trans. R. HESPEL, Louvain, 1964;

- SÉVÈRE (CSCO, 295-296), 1968 = SÉVÈRE d'Antioche, *La polémique antijulianiste, II, A, Le contra additiones Juliani* (CSCO, 295-296, s. Syri, 124-125). Ed. and trans. R. HESPEL, Louvain, 1968;

- SEVERUS, *KP*, ed., 1972 = *„Das Buch der kostbaren Perle" von Severus Ibn al-Muqaffa'*. Einleitung und arabischer Text (Kapitel 1-5) von Paul MAIBERGER (Akademie der Wissenschaften und der Literatur, 28), Wiesbaden, 1972 (the rest of the text is in a separate work not published);

- SPANEL, "Timothy", 1991 = D.B. SPANEL, "Timothy II Ælurus", *CE*, 7, pp. 2263-2268;

- TIMOTHEUS, *Widerlegung*, 1908 = *Timotheus Älurus' des Patriarchen von Alexandrien Widerlegung der auf der Synode zu Chalcedon festgesetzten Lehre*. Armenischer Text herausgegeben von Karapet TER-MĔKĔRTTSCHIAN, E. TER-MINASIANTZ, Leipzig, 1908;

- TU = Texte und Untersuchungen;

- VOISIN, *L'Apollinarisme*, 1901 = G. VOISIN, *L'Apollinarisme*, Louvain-Paris, 1901;

- WION, FRITSCH, *HA*, 2005 = A. WION, E. FRITSCH, "Haymanotä Abäw" *Encyclopedia Aethiopica* 2 (2005), pp. 1073-1075;

- YOUSSEF, "The quotations of Severus" = Youhanna Nessim YOUSSEF, "The quotations of Severus of Antioch in the Book of the Confessions of the Fathers" *Ancient Near Eastern Studies* 40 (2003), pp. 178-229;

Z = U. ZANETTI, *Les manuscrits de Dair Abû Maqâr, Inventaire* (Cahiers d'Orientalisme, 11), Genève, 1986.

Previous studies

The studies directly concerned with the *Confessio Patrum* (*CP*) are linked exclusively to the name of Georg Graf, while others relate to individual authors. These include the one most relevant to our argument, the work by Lietzmann[1] which appeared in 1904. It remains the major contribution to our knowledge of the texts attributed to the Roman Popes, and contains texts in the original language, Greek, together with others translated into Latin and German. The Apollinarist texts in Lietzmann's book were reedited and translated into Italian in Bellini's study published in 1977[2].

Basing himself on Lietzmann, Graf produced his first study of the *CP*, limited to the texts attributed to the Roman Popes, in 1929[3]. In the second part, he gave a full German translation based on the original Arabic which was still unpublished at the time.

Eight years later Graf published a more complete study of the *CP*[4]. It consists of seven parts: the manuscripts (MS); a bibliography; the structure; the sources; the *CP* in subsequent literature, or the influence of the *CP*; the Catholic arrangement or revision (*katholische Bearbeitung*); the individual authors in the order given in the *CP*. This last part takes up two thirds of the article and is the most important section. Graf also mentions partial editions (if any), the early translations (although he overlooks the Armenian version in the book of Timothy II)[5], and the recent translations of the texts and the studies.

It is interesting to note that several texts attributed to the Roman Popes and other great Fathers of the Church were forged by Apollinaris of Laodicea and his

[1] LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904.

[2] BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977.

[3] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929.

[4] GRAF, "Zwei", 1937.

[5] TIMOTHEUS, *Widerlegung*, 1908.

school[6]. Graf's last study in his great *Geschichte* appeared ten years later[7]. It is very brief and refers to the two previous studies, without adding anything new.

We were expecting an entry on the *CP* in *The Coptic Encyclopedia* (*CE*), but it never materialised. There is only one allusion to it, in the entry on "Al-Rashīd Abū al-Ḫayr Ibn al-Ṭayyib"[8].

A complete edition of the *CP*, based on a single manuscript at the Monastery of al-Muḥarraq dating from 1785, with an introduction on the individual authors, appeared for the first time in 2002[9]. Some authors have no introduction, however, either because they never actually existed or because the names are fake. We can consider the edition reliable, albeit uncritical. Nor has the editor made any effort to correct the distorted names, or even to give the right name in the notes. He is unaware of any of the previous partial editions of the text and the studies of the *CP*.

Three years later an article appeared in the *Encyclopedia Æthiopica*, presenting the text in an Ethiopic translation[10].

Presentation of the *CP*

The *CP* (*I'tirāf al-Abā'*; *Haymanotä Abäw*) is an Arabic anti-Chalcedonian patristic and post-patristic *Florilegium* or anthology[11]. This *Florilegium* is the

[6] For the writings of Apollinaris and his disciples, see LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904 and BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977, with important introductions. We also have several studies on Apollinaris; see; J. DRÄSEKE, *Apollinarios von Laodicea. Sein Leben und seine Schriften* (TU, 7, 3, 2), Leipzig, 1892; VOISIN, *L'Apollinarisme*, 1901; R. AIGRAIN, "Apollinaire", *Dictionnaire d'Histoire et de Géographie Ecclésiastiques*, tome 3 (Paris, 1924), col. 962-982; G. GENTZ, "Apollinaris v. Laodicea", *Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum*, Band 1 (Stuttgart, 1950), col. 520-522; E. MÜHLENBERG, *Apollinaris von Laodicea*, Göttingen, 1969; J. QUASTEN, *Patrologia*, 2, 1973, pp. 380-387; Bishop GREGORIOS, "Apollinarianism", *CE* 1, pp. 173-174; A. GRILLMEIER, *Gesù*, 1, 1982 pp. 607-629 and passim; F. CHIOVARO, "Apollinarianism", *New Catholic Encyclopedia*, 1, (Washington, 2003), pp. 559-560; Ch. KANNEGIESSER, "Apol(l)inarios v. Laodicea", *Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche*, Band 1 (Freiburg, 2006), col. 826-828; Ch. KANNEGIESSER, "Apollinare di Laodicea", *NDPAC*, 2006, col. 417-421; E. CATTANEO, "Apollinare di Laodicea", *Letteratura Patristica*. Diretto da A. DI BERARDINO, G. FEDALDO, M. SIMONETTI (Roma, 2007), pp. 118-121.

[7] GRAF, *GCAL*, 2, 1947, pp. 321-323.

[8] V. FREDRICK, "Al-Rashīd Abū al-Khayr Ibn al-Ṭayyib", *CE*, 1, p. 21.

[9] *CP*, ed., 2002.

[10] WION, FRITSCH, *HA*, 2005.

[11] For studies on *Florilegia* see GRILLMEIER, *Le Christ*, 1990, pp. 86-123 and passim; DI BE-

most comprehensive text that exists so far, and is a *unicum* in the Arabic language. It begins with the *Didascalia* or *Mystagogia*, regarded by the Copts as the work of the eleven apostles together with St. Paul. It ends with the patriarch Christodulos who died in 1077, and two brief texts by two Syrians or the so-called Jacobite authors: Abū Rā'iṭah al-Takrītī and Yaḥyā Ibn 'Adī.

The first source of the *CP* is the *Florilegium* of St. Cyril inserted in his *Epistola ad reginas*[12]. The *Florilegium* of Cyril was used by Timothy II of Alexandria († 477), also known as Αἴλουρος/Ælurus[13] and was expanded in his work against the Council of Chalcedon and the Tome of Pope Leo. This work was written in Greek, and was then translated into Coptic, but the two versions have been lost. It survived in many Syrian fragments, however[14], and a century ago the entire work was discovered and published in an Armenian translation[15].

Here we find the majority of the texts attributed to the Western Fathers. On the other hand, the texts of the Fathers mentioned in the *CP*, which come from the *Florilegium* of Timothy, form more than half the book. Timothy is mentioned only once in the final part of the *CP*, on the *anathemas*[16]. Timothy seems to be an unknown soldier, but was in fact the general leading the battle against the Christology of Chalcedon and the Tome of Leo, which is also the target of the *CP*. Spanel[17] called him: "the preeminent champion of

RARDINO, *Patrologia*, 5, pp. 166-169; B. STUDER, "Florilegia", *NDPAC*, 2, col. 1984-1988; an example of these *Florilegia* in Greek is the MS published by SCHWARTZ, *Codex Vaticanus*, 1927; there are also anti-Monophysite *Florilegia* such as the text published by F. DIEKAMP, *Doctrina Patrum de incarnatione Verbi. Ein griechisches Florilegium aus der Wende des 7. und 8. Jahrhundert*, Münster, 1907, 1981/2.

[12] CYRILLUS, *De Recta fide*, 1760 ; CYRILLUS, *De Recta fide*, 1863; see also DI BERARDINO, *Patrologia*, 5, 2000, p. 167: "I suoi [di Cirillo] florilegi costituiscono la base di quelli monofisiti, in esso troviamo anche citato un certo vescovo Vitalis. Inoltre san Cirillo nel *Florilegio Efesino* attribuisce un testo al vescovo Felix, e conosce altri testi di Giulio di Roma" ("His [Cyril's] *florilegia* form the basis of the Monophysite ones. We also find that a certain Bishop Vitalis is cited. In the *Ephesian Florilegium*, moreover, St Cyril attributes a text to Bishop Felix, and knows other texts by Julius of Rome").

[13] See GRILLMEIER, *Le Christ*, 1996, pp. 31-67 and passim; DI BERARDINO, *Patrologia*, 5, 2000, pp. 353-356; SPANEL, "Timothy", 1991.

[14] See the editions of FLEMMING, LIETZMANN, *ASc*, 1904;, LAGARDE, *AS*, 1885 and others.

[15] See TIMOTHEUS, *Widerlegung*, 1908.

[16] *CP*, ed., 2002, p. 398.

[17] SPANEL, "Timothy", 1991, p. 2263.

Monophysitism". Timothy is the *CP*'s main source, but in fact he drew on the *Florilegium* of St. Cyril and enlarged it, as Di Berardino rightly pointed out[18].

Many of the texts by the Fathers in the *CP* which come from Timothy II were mentioned in various works by Severus[19], Patriarch of Antioch (512-518)[20].

The rest of the *CP* contains numerous texts of letters called *Synodica* exchanged between the Coptic and the Syrian Patriarchs, which, in their turn, recall the writings of the earlier Fathers as well as the texts attributed to the Roman Popes.

I can identify neither the collector nor the translator of the texts of the Fathers from the work of Timothy and the subsequent works of Severus and others. Graf[21] discusses at length the convert from Islam, al-Wāḍiḥ Ibn Raǧā', as a translator of texts in the *CP* from Coptic to Arabic. He reviews the scholars who have supported this possibility, from J.S. Assemani (1687-1768) to this day. Their starting point is a gloss added to the title of the *CP* in Vatican Arabic 101 which states that al-Wāḍiḥ is the translator from Coptic into Arabic. Yet I cannot accept this. Nor can I consider Severus Ibn al-Muqaffa' as a translator, especially if Severus is regarded as the author of the *al-Durr al-ṯamīn*[22], since the two works give different translations of the same patristic texts. It is quite possible that the first translator of a collection of texts taken from the work of Timothy was Yūḥannā Ibn Abī Rakwah, mentioned in Vatican 178 (fol. 96r). It is worth pointing out that this name appears neither in the great *Geschichte* of Graf[23], nor in the other volumes.

[18] Di Berardino, *Patrologia*, 5, 2000, p. 167: "I suoi [di Cirillo] florilegi costituiscono la base di quelli monofisiti. I più estesi tra di essi sono stati aggiunti agli scritti che Timoteo Eluro fece circolare tra il 458 e il 477 contro le decisioni di Calcedonia (*CPG* 5475)") ("His [Cyril's] *florilegia* form the basis of the Monophysite ones. The longest ones were added to the writings circulated by Timothy Ælurus between 458 and 477 against the decisions of Chalcedon (*CPG* 5475)".

[19] See Youssef, "The quotations of Severus".

[20] See the section on individual authors.

[21] Graf, "Unechte", 1929, pp. 199-204.

[22] Severus, *KP*, ed., 1972.

[23] Graf, *GCAL*, 2, 1947.

The transmission of the *CP*

The first scholar to take an interest in the MS of the *CP* was Jordan[24], who listed the MS known in Europe, and especially in the Vatican Library. Graf, in his first article, mentioned 10 MS[25]. In his subsequent article[26], he divided the MS of the *CP* into three categories: the MS of the *CP*, those giving texts which depend on the *CP*[27], and the MS which he calls *die katholische Bearbeitung* (the Catholic arrangement or revision), and which he attributes to the Jesuit Gianbattista Eliano[28].

In his last work, *Geschichte*[29], Graf refers back to his two previous studies and does not add anything new.

I too have divided the MS of the *CP* into three categories. The first category comprises only Vatican Arabic 178. Contrary to Graf[30], I believe that Vat. 178 does not contain a text influenced by the *CP*, but presents a text that reflects a *Florilegium* predating the *CP*, probably derived from the work of Timothy II. The text includes two patristic collections. The first is entitled "Incarnation of our Lord Jesus Christ and the faith in it" (fol. 75v-95v). The second, untitled, is attributed to Yūḥannā Ibn Abī Rakwah (fol. 96r-114v), but is incomplete. The Western Fathers mentioned in this first collection are Felix, Innocent, Julius (4 sayings) and Metoligon. In the second collection we only have Julius (3 sayings) and Metoligon.

The second category includes the MS of the *CP* in full. I have here drawn up a chronological list and have indicated those MS not in Graf's list. My list is more complete than Graf's. The number may increase if we also study the unpublished catalogues of libraries in Egypt.

- Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, Arabic 183, 450 fol. (13th Century);

[24] JORDAN, *AI*, 1913, p. 66, note 1.

[25] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, p. 198.

[26] GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, pp. 345-346.

[27] GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, pp. 254-356.

[28] GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, pp 356-363; for Eliano see his autobiography, published by J.C. SOLA, "El P. Juan Bautista Eliana. Un documento autobiográfico inédito", *Archivium Historicum Societatis Iesu* 4 (1935), pp. 291-321.

[29] GRAF, *GCAL*, 2, 1947, pp. 321-323.

[30] GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, p. 354.

- Vatican Arabic 101, 2 volumes, 405 fol. (13/14th Century, mainly dating from 1688);
- Wādī al-Naṭrūn, Monastery of Anbā Maqār, Theology 2 (Z 273) (1420);
- Wādī al-Naṭrūn, Monastery of al-Suryān, Theology 113 (old 83), 181 fol. (1432);
- Red Sea, Monastery of St. Anthony, Theology 209, 179 fol. (1480);
- Cairo, Coptic Museum, Theology 196 (G 111, S 53), 3v-262v (1544);
- Cairo, Coptic patriarchate, Theology 133 (G 653, S 306), 196 fol. (17th Century);
- Asyūṭ, Dayr Tāsā, 23 (1726/7) (not in Graf);
- Cairo, Coptic patriarchate, Theology 188 (G 655, S 353), 246 fol. (1737);
- Cambridge, University, Add. 3288, 231 fol. (1750);
- Red Sea, Monastery of St. Paul, Theology 26, 263 fol. (1773);
- Wādī al-Naṭrūn, Monastery of Anbā Maqār, Theology 3 (Z 274) (1773) (not in Graf);
- Wādī al-Naṭrūn, Monastery of al-Suryān, Theology 114 (old 34), 228 fol. (1775) (not in Graf);
- Cairo, Franciscan Centre of Christian Oriental Studies, 119, pp. 7-206 (Excerpts) (1766/7) (not in Graf);
- Cairo, Coptic patriarchate, Theology 189 (G 654, S 396), 249 fol. (1781);
- Asyūṭ, Monastery of al-Muḥarraq, Theology 11/3 (1785) (not in Graf);
- Asyūṭ, Monastery of al-Muḥarraq, Theology 11/4 (1795) (not in Graf);
- Vatican Arabic 634, fol. 148v-286v (1795, copied from Vat. 101; contains only the second half);
- Cairo, Coptic patriarchate, Theology 213 (G 370, S 329), fol. 37v-54r (18th Century);
- Cairo, Coptic patriarchate, Theology 214 (G 389, S 330), 158 fol. (18th Century);
- Wādī al-Naṭrūn, Monastery of Anbā Bishoi, Theology 301 (1809) (not in Graf);
- Cairo, Coptic patriarchate, Liturgy 211/13-14 (S 952), (1828) (not in Graf);
- Red Sea, Monastery of St. Anthony, Theology 207, 261 fol. (1835) (not in Graf);
- Naqādah, Dayr al-Malāk, 429 fol. (1837) (not in Graf);
- Red Sea, Monastery of St. Anthony, Theology 206, 303 fol. (1843) (not in Graf);
- Cairo, Coptic patriarchate, Theology 186 (G 552, S 510), 260 fol. (1849);
- Birmingham, Mingana Arabic 41 [67], 317 fol. (1868);
- Beyrouth, Bibliothèque Orientale, 578, 353 fol. (1894) (copied from Vat. 101);

- Cairo, Coptic patriarchate, Theology 187 (G 656, S 551), 326 fol. (1900);
- Cairo, Coptic patriarchate, Theology 320 (S 564), (1931) (not in Graf);
- Cairo, Coptic patriarchate, Canon 26/6 (S 596) (not in Graf);
- Red Sea, Monastery of St. Anthony, Theology 208, 50 fol. (not in Graf);
- Red Sea, Monastery of St. Anthony, Theology 275, 101 (extracts) (not in Graf);
- Sharfah, Monastery of the Virgin of the Deliverance 9/ 32 (Karshuni) (not in Graf);
- Cairo, Coptic patriarchate, Theology 185 (S 322), 248 fol. (not in Graf);
- Cairo, Seminary of the Coptic Catholic, 4 (not in Graf);
- Asyūṭ, Monastery of al-Muḥarraq, Theology 11/5 (not in Graf);
- Naqādah, Dayr al-Malāk, (not in Graf).

The third category contains the MS which Graf[31] calls *die katholische Bearbeitung* (the Catholic arrangement or revision). He attached a great importance to this group. In fact, however, we are not dealing with a revision. The texts are simply selected extracts written in better Arabic than the other MS. Since only the marginal glosses are Catholic, I prefer to call them "Catholic MS", which were probably copied by Lebanese scholars who lived in Rome. These MS contain neither a date nor the names of the copyists. They are all preserved in the Vatican Library and the National Library of Rome (Christian Arabic 5-15; these MS were in the Library of Propaganda Fide). I have not seen these latter MS but they seem to be of little importance, since each one contains no more than a few folios[32]. I have studied the Vatican MS, and shall here only discuss the ones which present the texts of the Fathers of the Church in an order similar to the Collection in the *CP*, and not those which have arranged the texts thematically: Vatican Arabic: 121, 434, 485, 486.

A detailed study on the texts attributed to the Western authors

I have divided the texts of the Western Fathers contained in the *CP* into three categories.

[31] GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, p. 356.

[32] See Ignazio GUIDI, "Catalogo dei codici siriaci, arabi, turchi e persiani della Biblioteca Vittorio Emmanuele", *Catalogo dei codici orientali di alcune biblioteche d'Italia*, fascicolo 1, Firenze, 1878, pp. 8-12.

The first category includes the texts ascribed to St. Irenaeus († after 198)[33]. Although he lived later than some of them, he is ranked among the first Fathers of the Church. Two texts are attributed to him[34], besides a third one attributed to Archaeus, but which Severus of Antioch ascribes to Irenaeus[35].

The first text begins with the words: *Lex et prophetae et evangelia* ("The law and the prophets and the Gospels"). The Greek original is missing. We have an Armenian translation in the book of Timothy II, who was probably the first to attribute it to Irenaeus[36], and in *Sceau de la foi*[37]. Syriac versions too are extant[38]. Severus of Antioch mentions them, attributing them to Irenaeus[39]. In another version the Syriac text is attributed to Melito of Sardis († c. 190)[40]. The text, in fact, is not by Irenaeus, but by Melito. It was Jordan[41] who made this discovery, and indeed, there is some similarity between parts of the text and Melito's *On Easter* (§ 59 and 69). The version of the *CP* is a faithful translation from another work by Melito, *De fide*, which has been lost, but which survived in a fragment corresponding to the Arabic text[42]. The Arabic text was translated into Latin in Mai[43], before being published. The Syriac translation was translated into Latin[44] and into English from the text of Timothy[45] and into Latin from Severus[46]. The text was published for the first time, in its various versions,

[33] See QUASTEN, *Patrologia*, 1, 1975, pp. 255-279; A. ORBE, "Ireneo di Lione", *NDPAC*, 2007, col. 2609-2621.

[34] *CP*, ed., 2002, pp. 18-19.

[35] *CP*, ed., 2002, p. 246.

[36] TIMOTHEUS, *Widerlegung*, 1908, pp. 256, 28-257, 31; see CAVALLERA, "Le dossier", 1909, n. 19, III, 3, p. 355.

[37] *Sceau de la foi*, 1914, pp. 101, 10-102, 18; see LEBON, "Les Citations", 1929, n. XXI, 4, p. 22.

[38] PITRA, *AS*, 4, 1883, n. XXIX, p. 28.

[39] See the beginning of the text in Syriac and Latin in SEVERUS (CSCO, 119-120), 1949, trans., pp. 36-37.

[40] See NAUTIN, *Le dossier*, 1953, pp. 65-66.

[41] JORDAN, *AI*, 1913, pp. 84-87.

[42] See NAUTIN, *Le dossier*, 1953, pp. 65-66; MÉLITON de Sardes, *Sur la Pâque et fragments* (SC, 123). Par O. Perller, Paris, 1966, n. XV, pp. 240-245.

[43] MAI, *SR*, 3, 1840, pp. 704-705.

[44] PITRA, *AS*, 4, 1883, n. XXIX, p. 302.

[45] CONYBEARE, "The Patristic", 1914, pp. 433-434.

[46] SEVERUS (CSCO, 119-120), 1949, pp. 36-37.

by Jordan[47]. As for the Arabic text it is not found in the Catholic MS, while Vat. 178 (fol. 65r) gives a small part, which uses a single sentence from our text.

The second text begins with the words: *Libri sancti*. The Greek is not available. Instead we have an Armenian translation in the book of Timothy II, who was probably the first to attribute it to Irenaeus[48]. We also have translations into Syriac[49]. As a matter of fact, the work cannot be ascribed to Irenaeus. I regard it as unidentified, even if its contents are similar to Melito of Sardis and could be traced back to the lost work, *De fide*. The Arabic text was translated into Latin in Mai[50], before being published. The Syriac version was translated into Latin[51] and into English from the text of Timothy[52]. The text was published for the first time in its various versions, by Jordan[53]. It is not found in the Catholic MS, or in Vat. 178.

The third text[54] occurs in a work by Severus of Antioch[55]. It is not clear where the quotation ends, and we see that the title is confusing since it gives Irenaeus as bishop of Lyon and Smyrne. I regard the text as unidentified, but it may be by Irenaeus.

In the *CP* we have Atticus[56] of Constantinople after Irenaeus, followed by a certain Archaeus, Bishop of Liftin or Luftun[57]. It is clear that Luftun should be read "Luġdun" in Arabic, namely Lyon. Jordan has proved that Archaeus is simply Irenaeus[58]. This is also confirmed by Severus of Antioch, who at-

[47] JORDAN, *AI*, 1913, pp. 3-5 (Armenian), 56-60 (German from the Armenian), 69-70 (Arabic), 71-73 (trans. of the Arabic), 73-75 (trans. of the Ethiopic from the Arabic), 74-76 (German trans. of the Ethiopic).

[48] TIMOTHEUS, *Widerlegung*, 1908, pp. 257, 33-258, 25; see CAVALLERA, "Le dossier", 1909, n. 19, 2, p. 355.

[49] PITRA, *AS*, 4, 1883, n. XXVIII, pp. 27-28.

[50] MAI, *SR*, 3, 1840, p. 707.

[51] PITRA, *AS*, 4, 1883, n. XXVIII, pp. 300-301.

[52] CONYBEARE, "The Patristic", 1914, pp. 434-435.

[53] JORDAN, *AI*, 1913, pp. 5-7 (Armenian), 60-62 (trans. in German), 100-101 (Arabic), 101-103 (trans. of the Arabic), 103-104 (Ethiopic trans. of the Arabic), 104-106 (German trans of the Ethiopic).

[54] *CP*, ed., 2002, p. 246; see also GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, p. 365.

[55] SÉVÈRE (CSCO, 295-296), 1968, trans. p. 125.

[56] Not Attifus, as in the *CP*, ed., 2002, p. 20.

[57] *CP*, ed., 2002, p. 21.

[58] JORDAN, "Wer war Archaeus?", 1912, pp. 157-160; JORDAN, *AI*, 1913, p. 80.

tributes the text to Irenaeus[59]. The brief text speaks of the Passover which must be celebrated on a Sunday. The Arabic text of the *CP* mentions a letter to Alexander, but the letter is actually addressed to an Alexandrian: "à un certain alexandrin", as Severus points out, followed by Jordan: "Fragment eines Briefes des Irenaeus an einen Alexandriner"[60]. I do not know if the text is by Irenaeus, and Hespel, the editor and translator of Severus, considers it unidentified. The Arabic text was translated into Latin in Mai[61], while the Syriac version of Severus was translated into French[62].

The second and third category of Western writers in the *CP* include a series of names of real and fictitious Roman Popes. The texts come after Gregory of Nyssa († c. 395) and before Ephrem the Syrian († 373). I have divided this group of texts into two categories. The first includes several names, while the second is devoted only to Julius.

In the second category we consequently have different names in the following order: Felix, Innocent, Metoligon and Vitalis. Let us start with Felix (269-274)[63]. We know that St. Cyril attributed some suspect texts to Felix. According to Grillmeier: "Certain circles seem to have used this moment to send the Patriarch of Alexandria a number of works, among them some which bore the names of the Roman Popes Julius and Felix. Here Cyril reads the words and formulas which are become a matter of dispute to theological factions for centuries"[64]. Spinelli's opinion is similar[65].

[59] SÉVÈRE (CSCO 295-296), 1968, p. 125.

[60] See also JORDAN, "Wer war Archaeus?", 1912, p. 159.

[61] MAI, *SR*, 3, 1840, p. 707.

[62] SÉVÈRE (CSCO 295-296), 1968, p. 125.

[63] See QUASTEN, *Patrologia*, 1, 1975, pp. 488-489; M. SPINELLI, "Felice I papa", *NDPAC*, 2007, col. 1926-1927.

[64] GRILLMEIER, *Christ*, 1, 1975, p. 473; GRILLMEIER, *Gesù*, 1, 1982, p. 860: "Sembra che certi circoli abbiano atteso questo momento, per inviare al patriarca di Alessandria un certo numero di opere, alcune delle quali portavano i nomi dei papi romani Giulio e Felice. È qui che Cirillo trova i termini e le formule che diventeranno materia di disputa, per secoli, tra le fazioni teologiche".

[65] M. SPINELLI, "Felice I papa", *NDPAC*, 2007, col. 1927: "Quindi è verosimile che appartenga, proprio a F., una frase citata da Cirillo, anche se probabilmente è stata rimaneggiata (ACO I, I, 7, 45)" ("It is therefore likely that a phrase quoted by Cyril is in fact by F even if it has probably been altered (ACO I, I, 7, 45)".

The *CP*[66] ascribes to Felix three brief texts which do not exist in the original Greek.

The first is taken from an Apollinarist text transmitted to us in an Armenian translation in the book of Timothy II[67]. There is also a Syriac version published by Zingerle[68], and translated into German by Lietzmann: "Wir verfluchen [?] aber die... in seiner ganzen göttlichen hypostase"[69], and into Italian by Bellini[70]. Graf translated the Arabic text into German[71]. It is also mentioned in Benjamin I[72]. The same text of Benjamin I is used in the book of Severus Ibn al-Muqaffa'[73].

The second and third text of Felix are not identified, but they seem to be of Apollinarist origin, and are only translated into German by Graf: 1) "Was die Scheidung... uns Bruder geworden; 2) Wir glauben also an Christus... den schliessen wir aus"[74]. Only the third text uses a specifically Monophysite phrase: the famous *Mia Physis*.

In the second category I have also placed the text under the name of Pope Innocent (402-417)[75]. In the Catholic and late MS, and in the edition[76], the text is attributed, to Abūlīdus (Hippolytus) († c. 235), which, in the *CP*, is a corruption of the name of Julius (337-352). Since the text is a letter to Severian of Gabala († 408/425)[77], the person can only be Innocent, a contemporary of Severian. Graf[78], who could not identify the text, writes: "Über die Herkunft des Zitates kann noch nichts Sicheres gesagt werden" ("About the origin of

[66] *CP* ed., 2002, pp. 86-87.

[67] TIMOTHEUS, *Widerlegung*, 1908, pp. 2, 5-12.

[68] *MS*, 1, 1869, pp. 2-3.

[69] LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904, n. 186, pp. 319, 16-20.

[70] BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977, n. 186, pp. 184-185.

[71] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, pp. 206, 213; see also GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, n. 45, 1, p. 372.

[72] *CP*, ed., 2002, p. 264.

[73] SEVERUS, *KP*, ed., 1972, cap. 7, p. 211.

[74] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, pp. 206, 213-214; see also GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, n. 46-47, 2-3, p. 372.

[75] See DI BERARDINO, *Patrologia*, 3, 1978, pp. 550-553; B. STUDER, "Innocenzo I papa", *NDPAC*, 2007, col. 2563-2564.

[76] *CP*, ed., 2002, pp. 97-98.

[77] See QUASTEN, *Patrologia*, 2, 1973, pp. 487-489; S.J. VOICU, "Severiano di Gabala", *NDPAC*, 2008, coll. 4907-4910.

[78] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, n. IV, p. 209.

the quotation, nothing definite can as yet be said"). In fact, the text is not a letter from Pope Innocent I, who did not write letters to Severian, or at least not this one. According to Lietzmann it comes from a disciple of Apollinaris[79]. Lietzmann gives a Latin translation: "Et ipse est ille... immo deus qui eos creavit, anathematizat", and Bellini[80] gives an Italian one. We have a translation of the Arabic text into Latin in Mai[81] and in Pitra[82]. There is a German translation by Graf[83]. Several elements in the text attributed to Innocent are found in the letter of Severus of Antioch to the Emperor Anastasius († 518)[84].

"Metoligon" too belongs to the second category. Metoligon is not a name of a Roman Pope, although, in some MS, he was named archbishop, patriarch and Pope of Rome, even in Syriac script (ܐܠܐܕ ܡܛܘܠܝܓܘܢ ܚܕܐ ܕܗܘ ܒܣܪ). The editor of the Arabic text, who provided a few dates and some information for each author mostly derived from the Coptic *Synaxarion*, said nothing about Metoligon. He did not even draw attention to the strangeness of the name. The fact is that Metoligon is not a personal noun. Graf[85] has explained the meaning of the name: "Aber der angebliche Autor braucht in der Literaturgeschichte nicht gesucht zu werden; denn das rätselhafte Wort ist nichts anderes als die unverändert in die koptische Sammlung übergegangen Phrase (καὶ εἶπε) μετ᾽ ὀλίγον, womit in den Florilegien die Exzerpte aneinander gereiht werden" ("But the alleged author need not be sought in the history of literature, for the mysterious word is none other than the transcription, which had passed unchanged into the Coptic collection, of the phrase (καὶ εἶπε) μετ᾽ ὀλίγον, which connects the excerpts in the *Florilegia*"). Graf did not discover the source of the text, even though he might have done so. He wrote: "Schwieriger als diese Feststellung ist die Identifizierung des Zitates selbst" ("More difficult than this is the identification of the quotation itself"). Starting with the words μετ᾽ ὀλίγον (in Latin: "post pauca" and in English: "after a few [words]"), I noticed that the Latin expression is used on several occasions in

[79] LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904, n. 189, pp. 321, 13-322, 5.

[80] BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977, pp. 186-189.

[81] MAI, *SR*, 3, 1840, pp. 703-704.

[82] PITRA, *AS*, 2, 1888, n. XII, p. XXXIII.

[83] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, n. IV, pp. 209, 228-229; see also GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, n. 57, 10, p. 373.

[84] *CP*, ed., 2002, pp. 240-242.

[85] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, n. III, p. 209, 6-10.

the *Florilegium* of Timothy II, when he cites the works of St. Cyril of Alexandria[86]. Starting from the *CP* itself, I found the text in the second letter of St. Cyril to Succensus (§3)[87]: "Again they twist the facts, failing to recognize that the reality is one incarnate nature of the Word... as I said, *incarnate* nature"[88]. We do not know whether the creation of the name of Metoligon, dates back to the Coptic translator of the *Florilegium* of Timothy II, or to the Arabic translator. This text exists in the three groups of MS. Graf translated one of them into German[89]. St. Cyril's Greek original is still extant and other versions too are available, including the Armenian one, in Timothy II[90]. Cyril's text, with the proper attribution, in a different translation, also occurs in the *al-Durr al-ṯamīn* attributed to Severus Ibn al-Muqaffa'[91].

The second category includes the name of Pope Sylvester (314-335)[92]. A brief dialogue with a Jew named Noah is attributed to him. It deals with the union of the divine with the human nature, and the impassivity of the divine nature in the passion, with an analogy of the axe, the tree and the sun: "Si quis in meridie arborem... quin divinitas diminutionem ullam propter passionem perpessa est". The text is apocryphal, and has no ancient source. It does not appear in Vat. 178, or in the Catholic MS. It was translated from Arabic into Latin in Mai[93] and thence in *PL*[94], and was subsequently translated into German by Graf[95].

Finally, in the same category we have a text attributed to Pope Vitalis. In this case too, we can say that there was no Roman Pope called Vitalis. The editor of the Arabic text knew this and thus does not write a biographical note

[86] See CAVALLERA, "Le dossier", 1909, pp. 348-351, especially 351.

[87] CYRIL of Alexandria, *Select letters*. Ed. and trans. L.R. WICKHAM, Oxford, 1983, pp. 86-89; CIRILLO di Alessandria, *Epistole cristologiche* (Collana di Testi Patristici, 146), Roma, 1999, pp. 192-193: "Ancora una volta, quanti stravolgono l'ortodossia... Però, come ho detto, incarnata".

[88] *CP*, ed., 2002, p. 208.

[89] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, n. III. pp. 208-209, 228.

[90] TIMOTHEUS, *Widerlegung*, 1908, p. 178, 9-28.

[91] SEVERUS, *KP*, ed., 1972, cap. 3, 1972, ed., pp. 23-24.

[92] See DUCHESNE, *Le Liber Pontificalis*, vol. 1, Paris, 1886, pp. CIX-CXII, especially CXII; B. STUDER, "Silvestro I papa", *NDPAC*, 2008, col. 4938-4939.

[93] MAI, *SR*, 3, 1840, p. 701.

[94] *PL*, 8, 1844, col. 814.

[95] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, n. V, pp. 209-210, 229-230; see also GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, n. 58, pp. 373-374.

on Vitalis[96]; the name appears in the form of Antalis and Abtalis. But if there is no Roman bishop called Vitalis, there is indeed an Apollinarist writer of that name who was bishop of Antioch († c. 385)[97]. He was a moderate Apollinarist who wrote a work entitled *De Fide*, in which he defends the full humanity of Christ with a rational soul. A fragment of this work appears in the *Florilegium* of St. Cyril of Alexandria: Ἔτι δὲ περὶ τῆς κατὰ σάρκα... ἔστω ἀνάθεμα[98]. Cyril simply called Vitalis a bishop, without specifying his see, while Timothy II described him as bishop of Rome[99]. With that same qualification Vitalis passed into the Armenian *Sceau de la foi*[100]. We also have a Syriac version[101], where the text is attributed to Julius of Rome. The Arabic text of the *CP* is neither in Vat. 178 nor in the Catholic MS. Graf gave a German translation[102]. In *al-Durr al-ṯamīn*, attributed to Severus Ibn al-Muqaffa'[103], the author quotes the last words ascribed to Vitalis in a different translation, while the second sentence is taken from the *anathemas* at the end of the *CP*.

In the third category of texts attributed to the Roman Popes I have placed the works ascribed to Pope Julius (337-352)[104]. Pope Julius was a friend of St. Athanasius (328-373) and defended him. It therefore seems natural that just as the Apollinarists attributed some texts to the bishop of Alexandria, they should have attributed others to the Roman Pope, also because of his great authority. St. Cyril of Alexandria received some of these texts and had no doubt that they were by Julius[105]. In the late MS and in the Catholic ones the name of Julius was corrupted into that of Hippolytus, the two names bearing a close resemblance in Arabic script, and Hippolytus being best known as Julius in

[96] *CP*, ed., 2002 p. 101.

[97] See VOISIN, *L'Apollinarisme*, 1901, pp. 229-233; E. CAVALCANTI, "Vitale apollinarista", *NDPAC*, 2008, col. 5665.

[98] CYRILLUS, *De recta fide ad reginas*, 1760, col. 693E-696B; CYRILLUS, *De Recta fide*, 1863, col. 1215-1216; LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904, n. 172, p. 273; BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977, p. 124, with an Italian translation.

[99] TIMOTHEUS, *Widerlegung*, 1908, pp. 7, 25-8, 12, 191, 7-29; see CAVALLERA, "Le dossier", 1909, n. 26, p. 358.

[100] *Sceau e la foi,* 1914, pp. 107, 22-109, 9; see LEBON, "Les citations", 1929 , n. XXIX, p. 30.

[101] See J.P.N. LAND, *Anecdota Syriaca*, 3, Leiden, 1870, p. 155, 8-24.

[102] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, n. VI, pp, 210-211, 230; see also GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, n. 59, p. 374.

[103] SEVERUS, *KP*, ed., 1972, cap. 7, ed., p. 204.

[104] See B. STUDER, "Giulio I papa", *NDPAC*, 2007, col. 2317-2318.

[105] See here note 64.

the Coptic Arabic Literature. In the *CP*, the texts attributed to Julius appear after those ascribed to Felix, and before the one under the name of Innocent[106]. They are eight texts of varying length.

The first[107] is presented as a letter of Julius to Dionysius. If it refers to Dionysius of Alexandria († c. 265)[108], he must have been a contemporary of Dionysius of Rome (259-268)[109] rather than of Julius (337-352). The two Dionysiuses corresponded about the Trinity and Christology, but our text has nothing to do with this correspondence. It is, rather, by Apollinaris, placed under the name of Julius. The original Greek text, with a Latin translation, was published in *PL*[110], the Greek in Lietzman[111]: Θαυμάζω πυνθανόμενος... ἐρρωμένως διάγοις κύριε and in Bellini[112], with an Italian translation. There is an Armenian version in the book of Timothy II[113] and a Syriac translation[114]. It exists partially in Syriac, with a Latin translation, in a work by Severus of Antioch[115] and another, with a French translation, in a work by Philoxenus of Mabbog[116]. A part of the Arabic text is translated into Latin in Pitra[117]. The whole text is translated into German by Graf[118]. In the work *al-Durr al-ṯamīn* attributed to Severus Ibn al-Muqaffa'[119] there is a part of the text (§ 5-6) in a different translation.

[106] *CP*, ed., 2002, pp. 88-97.

[107] *CP*, ed. 2002, pp. 88-91.

[108] See QUASTEN, *Patrologia*, 1, 1975, pp. 369-375; P. NAUTIN, E. PRINZIVALLI, "Dionigi di Alessandria", *NDPAC*, 2006, col. 1431-1432.

[109] See QUASTEN, *Patrologia*, 1, 1975, pp. 486-488; B. STUDER, "Dionigi papa", *NDPAC*, 2006, col. 1430-1431.

[110] *PL* 8, 1844, col. 929: Scripta suspectae fidei.

[111] LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904, pp. 256-262.

[112] BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977, pp. 100-105.

[113] TIMOTHEUS, *Widerlegung*, 1908, pp. 259, 26-262, 37; see CAVALLERA, "Le dossier", 1909, n. 20, pp. 355-356.

[114] LAGARDE, *AS*, 1858, pp. 67-70; FLEMMING, LIETZMANN, *ASc*, 1904, pp. 35-39.

[115] SEVERUS, (CSCO 119-120), 1949, trans., p. 21.

[116] PHILOXÈNE, *Lettre* (CSCO, 231-232), 1963, trad., p. 31.

[117] PITRA, *AS*, 2, 1884, n. I-III, p. XXXII.

[118] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, n. 1, pp. 206-207, 214-219; see also GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, n. 48, 1, p. 372.

[119] SEVERUS, *KP*, ed., 1972, cap. 6, pp. 70-71.

The second text attributed to Pope Julius is also presented as a letter from the Pope, but to Prosdocius, who must be a little known Apollinarist. The text is in fact a letter, not from Julius, but from Timothy, Bishop of Berytus[120], who, according to Bellini, was a radical Apollinarist[121]. From the text, however, he appears to be a moderate. The Greek text with a Latin translation was first published in 1750[122] and in 1844 in *PL*[123]. The Greek text also appears in Lietzmann[124]: τό φρόνημα ἡμῶν... τοῦ ἁγίου βαπτίσματος, and with an Italian translation in Bellini[125]. There is an Armenian translation in Timothy II[126] and the *Sceau de la foi*[127]. There is also a Syriac translation[128]. We have, again, in Syriac, with a Latin translation, two small parts in a work by Severus of Antioch[129]. A part of the Arabic text is translated into Latin in Pitra[130]. The full text is translated into German by Graf[131].

The third text which is presented as a letter from Julius to Dionysius is only three lines long[132]. Neither Lietzmann[133], nor Graf[134] have connected the short Arabic text with Apollinaris' *De unione*, from which it is drawn. Lietzmann has published the Greek text[135] and Bellini an Italian translation[136]. There is a

[120] See VOISIN, *L'Apollinarisme*, 1901, p. 112-113; E. CAVALCANTI, "Timoteo apollinarista", *NDPAC*, 2008, col. 5360-5361.

[121] BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977, p. 22.

[122] *Julii primi, episcopi Romani, ad Prosdocium Epistola de Trinitate et incarnatione ex codice Oxoniesi,* edita Johann Gottlieb EHRLICH, Leipzig, 1750, 35 p.

[123] *PL*, 8, 1844, col. 954-949.

[124] LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904, pp. 283-286.

[125] BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977, pp. 138-141.

[126] TIMOTHEUS, *Widerlegung*, 1908 pp. 262, 38-264, 31; see CAVALLERA, "Le dossier", 1909, n. 20, pp. 355-356.

[127] *Sceau de la foi*, 1914, pp. 341, 29-342, 26; see LEBON, "Les Citations", 1929, n. XXIV, 1, p. 27.

[128] LAGARDE, *AS*, 1858, pp. 70-71; FLEMMING, LIETZMANN, *ASc*, 1904, pp. 39-40; RUCKER, *FEA*, 1933, n. II, 1, 11, 2, p. 7.

[129] SEVERUS (CSCO, 101-102), 1959, trans., § 2b, p. 219; § 4b-5, pp. 219-220.

[130] PITRA, *AS*, 2, 1884, n. IV-VIII, pp. XXXII-XXXIII.

[131] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, n. 2, pp. 207, 219-221; see also GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, n. 49, 2, p. 373.

[132] *CP*, ed., 2002, p. 93.

[133] LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904, n. 188, pp. 187, 321.

[134] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, n. 3, p. 207; GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, n. 50, 3, p. 373.

[135] LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904, § 5, p. 187.

[136] BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977, pp. 50-51.

Syriac version with a Latin translation in Severus of Antioch[137]. The Arabic text of the *CP* is translated into Latin in Pitra[138], in Lietzmann[139] and in Bellini[140], with an Italian translation, and into German by Graf[141]. In the *al-Durr al-ṯamīn* attributed to Severus Ibn al-Muqaffa'[142] we find a continuation of this text, still attributed to Julius "Patriarch of Rome".

The fourth text attributed to Julius (as in Paris 183), but which, in the Catholic MS, in others, and in the edition[143], is ascribed to Hippolytus. It is presented under the guise of a circular (*Encyclion*) to the bishops of the Catholic Church. It is missing in the two Vatican MS 178 and 101. In fact the text is neither by Julius nor by Hippolytus, or any other Roman Pope, but by a disciple of Apollinaris. The original Greek text is published in Lietzmann[144] and with an Italian translation in Bellini[145]. There is an Armenian translation in Timothy II[146]. There is also a Syriac version[147]. A part of the Arabic text is translated into Latin in Pitra[148]. The full text is translated into German by Graf[149].

The fifth text is relatively short[150]. This is not by Julius either, but comes from Apollinaris' treatise *De unione* (§ 7-8). The Greek text is published in *PL*[151], in Lietzmann[152]: καὶ ὅτε λέγει ὅτι »δόξαχόν με«... καὶ τῇ ὀνομασίᾳ τῆς ἡμῖν ὁμοουσίου σαρκός, and in Bellini[153] with an Ital-

[137] SEVERUS (CSCO, 101-102), 1959, trans., p. 220.

[138] PITRA, *AS*, 2, 1884, n. IX, p. XXXIII.

[139] LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904, n. 188, p. 321.

[140] BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977, n. 188, pp. 186-187.

[141] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, n. 3, pp. 207, 221; see also GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, n. 50, 3, p. 373.

[142] SEVERUS, *KP*, ed., 1972, cap. 3, p. 31.

[143] *CP*, ed., 2002, p. 93.

[144] LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904, p. 292.

[145] BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977, pp. 150-151.

[146] TIMOTHEUS, *Widerlegung*, 1908, pp. 264, 33-265, 28; see CAVALLERA, "Le dossier", 1909, n. 20, I, p. 355.

[147] FLEMMING, LIETZMANN, *ASc*, 1904, p. 41.

[148] PITRA, *AS*, 2, 1884, n. X, p. XXXIII.

[149] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, n. 4, pp. 207, 221-222; see also GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, n. 51,4, p. 373.

[150] *CP*, ed. 2002, p. 94.

[151] *PL* 8, 1844, col. 874.

[152] LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904, p. 188, 4-18.

[153] BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977, pp. 50-51.

ian translation. There is an Armenian translation in Timothy II[154]. There is also a Syriac translation[155]. We still have a Syriac translation in two works by Severus of Antioch, with a Latin translation in the first, and a French one in the second, In both works the text is attributed to Julius of Rome[156]. The first part of the Arabic text is translated into Latin in Pitra[157] and the full text is translated into German by Graf[158].

The sixth text too is relatively short[159]. Here again the text is not by Pope Julius, but comes from Apollinaris' *De Fide et incarnatione* (§ 6b). Lietzmann gives the original Greek text[160]: οὐκôν εἰ σὰρξ ὁ λόγος γέγονεν... ὅλος θεός, ὅλος ἄνθροπος ο αὐτός, and Bellini[161] gives an Italian translation. There is a Syriac translation[162], translated into German in Lietzmann[163]. We also know some parts of it in two works by Severus of Antioch with Latin and French translations[164] and a part in Philoxenus of Mabbug, translated into French[165]. The Arabic text is missing in the Catholic MS, but we have a German translation in Graf[166].

The seventh text attributed to Pope Julius[167] is taken from Apollinaris' *De fide et incarnatione* (§ 8-9). The Greek original is lost, but there is an Armenian translation in Timothy II[168] and a Syriac translation[169] translated in

[154] TIMOTHEUS, *Widerlegung*, 1908, pp. 9, 31-10, 15; see CAVALLERA, "Le dossier", 1909, n. 20, VI, 6, p. 356.

[155] LAGARDE, *AS*, 1858, p. 73, 16-28; FLEMMING, LIETZMANN, *ASc*, 1904, p. 119, § 7-8.

[156] SEVERUS (CSCO, 93-94), 1952, trans., pp. 50-51; SÉVÈRE (CSCO, 244-245), 1964, p. 57.

[157] PITRA, *AS*,, 2, 1884, n. XI, p. XXXIII.

[158] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, n. 5, pp. 208, 222-223, see also Graf, "Zwei", 1937, n. 52, 5, p. 373.

[159] *CP*, ed., 2002, p. 94.

[160] LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904, pp. 198, 4-199, 2.

[161] BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977, pp. 60-63.

[162] FLEMMING, LIETZMANN, *ASc*, 1904, pp. 28-29; RUCKER, *FEA*, 1933, frag. 11,3, p. 7*.

[163] LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904, pp. 198, 4-199, 2.

[164] SEVERUS (CSCO 119-120), 1949, trans., p. 37; SEVERUS (CSCO 101, 102), 1959, p. 220.

[165] PHILOXÈNE (CSCO 232), 1963, trans., p. 30.

[166] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, n. 6, pp. 208, 223-224; see also GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, n. 53, 6, p. 373.

[167] *CP*, ed., 2002, p. 95.

[168] TIMOTHEUS, *Widerlegung*, 1908, pp. 265, 30-266, 29; see CAVALLERA, "Le dossier", 1909, n. 20, IV, 4, p. 356.

[169] FLEMMING, LIETZMANN, *ASc*, 1904, pp. 30-31.

Latin by Lietzmann[170]: *Dei adventum*, and again, with an Italian translation in Bellini[171]. The Arabic text is missing in Vat. 178 and in the Catholic MS. It is translated into German by Graf[172].

The eighth and last text attributed to Julius[173] is relatively long, it reproduces the third letter by an unknown disciple of Apollinaris which is lost in the original. It survives in an Armenian version in Timothy II[174] and in the *Sceau de la foi*[175]. There is a Syriac version[176] translated into German in Lietzmann[177] and an Italian translation in Bellini[178]: *Salutem nobis parat*. The Arabic text is missing in Vat. 178 and in the Catholic MS. It was translated into German by Graf[179].

At the end of the *CP* there is a series of *anathemas* attributed to different Fathers. Six of them are ascribed to Julius[180] and five to Vitalis[181]. These *anathemas* are formulated from the same texts attributed to the two Popes. The title of these texts is important; the first is said to have been mentioned in the book of Timothy, and the second to be taken from Cyril. The opening parts of the two series are translated into Latin in Pitra[182]. Graf examines the two texts[183].

[170] LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904, pp. 200-203.

[171] BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977, pp. 62-65.

[172] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, n. 7, pp. 208, 224-225; see also GRAF, "Zwei", 1937 n. 54,7, p. 373.

[173] *CP*, ed., 2002, pp. 95-97.

[174] TIMOTHEUS, *Widerlegung*, 1908, pp. 266, 31-268, 33; see CAVALLERA, "Le dossier", 1909, n. 20, V, 5, p. 356.

[175] *Sceau e la foi,* 1914, pp. 342, 28-345, 19; see LEBON, "Les Citations", 1929, n. XXIV, 2, p. 27.

[176] FLEMMING, LIETZMANN, *ASc*, 1904, pp. 49-51.

[177] LIETZMANN, *Apollinaris*, 1904, pp. 307, 20-310, 13.

[178] BELLINI, *Su Cristo*, 1977, pp. 166-171.

[179] GRAF, "Unechte", 1929, n. 8, pp. 208, 225-228; see also GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, n. 55, 8, p. 373.

[180] *CP*, ed., 2002, p. 298.

[181] *CP*, ed., 2002, p. 399.

[182] PITRA, *AS*,, 2, 1884, n. XIII-XV, p. XXXIII.

[183] GRAF, "Unechte", pp. 231-233; GRAF, "Zwei", 1937, n. 248-249, p. 400.

Conclusion

The title of this article is *The Western Fathers in the* Confessio Patrum, while it is true that the *CP* contains the names of Western Fathers such as Irenaeus, Felix, Julius (or Hippolytus), Innocent and Sylvester, we never encounter any of the ideas of these Fathers. Indeed, the ideas in these texts are the very opposite of those of the Fathers.

The ideas of the Western Fathers may be lacking, but there is a great deal of Apollinarism. Apollinaris and his disciples were thus more successful in fulfilling their aim than they expected or hoped. St. Cyril was influenced by their terminology[184]: Apollinaris attributed his own works to several authors, including Athanasius. Cyril himself was a victim of Apollinarist forgery, which invaded a number of Christological writings. From Cyril, the influence passed on to his successors: Dioscorus, Timothy II[185], etc. It then crossed the boundaries of Egypt, and the texts were rehearsed by Severus of Antioch[186], Philoxenus of Mabbug and others, down to this day. Apollinaris and his disciples wrote their texts in Greek. Then, soon after, they were used by Cyril, Timothy and Severus and were translated into Coptic, Syriac, Armenian and Latin. In the Middle Ages the texts were translated from Coptic into Arabic, and thence into Ge'ez, the language of the Ethiopian Church. Over the past two centuries new translations appeared: German, French, Amharic, and more recently, Italian. Not only are the texts in the *CP* attributed to the Roman popes Apollinarist, but Apollinarist texts are placed side by side with texts attributed to St. Gregory Thaumaturgus, St. Athanasius and St. Gregory of Nazianzus[187].

The Arabic text of the *CP* does not enjoy any great importance in the Coptic Church. It is neither widely known among the faithful, nor is it much studied. Those few individuals who took an interest in it did so in order to gather information about the relations of the Syrian Church with the Coptic Church (the subject of the second part of the book).

[184] See A. HAMMAN, F. GORI, "Falsificazione", *NDPAC*, 2007, col. 1902-1903: "Apollinare attribuì le proprie opere a diversi autori, tra cui Atanasio. Cirillo stesso fu vittima di falsificazioni apollinariste, che invasero una serie di scritti cristologici".

[185] See A. DI BERARDINO, *Patrologia*, 5, 2000, p. 167.

[186] About the place of Severus of Antioch in the *CP* see YOUSSEF, "The quotations of Severus".

[187] See GRAF, "Zwei", 1937; CAVALLERA, "le dossier", 1909; LEBON, "Les citations", 1929.

In the Ethiopian and Eritrean Orthodox Churches, on the other hand, the text is held in high regard[188]. It is known as *Haymanota Abew* and has been commented upon in the traditional exegesis known as *andemta*. The *CP* is read to this day during the Eucharistic celebration and during Holy Week. So far nobody has raised questions about its authorship or its authenticity.

Although they admit that Apollinaris is a heretic the followers of the non-Chalcedonian Churches find in these texts a confirmation of their faith.

In this article I do not wish to imply that the faithful of these Churches are Apollinarist. My research has simply led me to conclude that the Apollinarist texts (which are naturally moderate) have circulated freely and continue to do so, hidden under the guise of accepted fathers such as Athanasius, and other Roman Popes.

The two articles by Graf and that of Cavallera have been very useful for my research[189].

Rome, June 1, 2012, the Feast of St. Justin the Philosopher and Martyr

Cairo, January, 6, 2014, the Solemnity of the Epiphany

wadiawad@gmail.com

[188] Ayelè TEKLEHAYMANOT, "The theological terminology of the Haymanota Abaw used in the Ethiopian Othodox Church", *Adveniat Regnum Tuum* (Asmara, 1986), pp. 87-110; republished in *Ethiopian Review of Cultures* 3 (Addis Ababa, without date), pp. 219-286.

[189] I thank Prof. S.J. Voicu, who drew my attention to the article of Cavallera and others, and I thank my friend Abba Tedros Abraha with whom I often discussed this work, and who was kind enough to make a first correction, and I thank Prof. Alastair Hamilton for his final correction.